

**UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY  
REGION 5**

<b>In the Matter of:</b>	)	<b>Docket No. CERCLA-05-2023-0002</b>
	)	
<b>The City of Cincinnati, Operator of the Polk Run Wastewater Treatment Facility Loveland, Ohio,</b>	)	<b>Proceeding to Assess a Civil Penalty Under Section 109(b) of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act</b>
	)	
<b><u>Respondent.</u></b>	)	

**Consent Agreement and Final Order  
Preliminary Statement**

1. This is an administrative action commenced and concluded under Section 109(b) of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act (CERCLA), as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 9609(b), and Sections 22.13(b) and 22.18(b)(2) and (3) of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules) as codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

2. The Complainant is, by lawful delegation, the Manager of Emergency Response Branch 1, Superfund & Emergency Management Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 5.

3. Respondent is the City of Cincinnati, a municipality in the State of Ohio.

4. Where the parties agree to settle one or more causes of action before the filing of a complaint, the administrative action may be commenced and concluded simultaneously by the issuance of a consent agreement and final order (CAFO). 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b) and 22.18(b)(2) and (3).

5. The parties agree that settling this action without the filing of a complaint or the adjudication of any issue of fact or law is in their interest and in the public interest.

6. Respondent consents to the assessment of the civil penalty specified in this CAFO, and the terms of the CAFO.

**Jurisdiction and Waiver of Right to Hearing**

7. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations in this CAFO and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations in this CAFO.

8. Respondent waives its right to request a hearing as provided at 40 C.F.R. § 22.15(c), any right to contest the allegations in this CAFO, and its right to appeal this CAFO.

**Statutory and Regulatory Background**

9. Section 103(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9603(a), requires any person in charge of a facility to immediately notify the National Response Center (NRC) as soon as that person has knowledge of any release of a hazardous substance from the facility in an amount equal to or greater than the reportable quantity of the hazardous substance.

10. Section 103(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9603(a), provides a mechanism to alert federal agencies that a response action may be necessary to prevent deaths or injuries to emergency responders, facility personnel, and the local community. A delay or failure to notify could seriously hamper the government's response to an emergency and pose serious threats to human health and the environment.

11. Section 109(b) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9609(b), and 40 C.F.R. Part 19 authorizes U.S. EPA to assess a civil penalty of up to \$62,689 per day of violation, for each violation of CERCLA Section 103, that occurred after November 2, 2015, and for which penalties are assessed on or after January 12, 2022, or other amounts as penalty levels may be later adjusted at 40 C.F.R. Part 19.

### **Factual Allegations and Alleged Violations**

12. Respondent is a “person” as that term is defined under Section 101(21) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(21).
13. Respondent, through its Department of Sewers, operates and maintains the Metropolitan Sewer District of Greater Cincinnati, an Ohio Revised Code Chapter 6117 county sewer district, as the sole management agency for the Board of County Commissioners of Hamilton County, Ohio, pursuant to an agreement between the City and the Board dated April 12, 1968.
14. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent was in charge of the Polk Run Wastewater Treatment facility located at 9744 East Kemper Road, Loveland, Ohio (facility).
15. Respondent’s facility consists of a building, structure, installation, equipment, pipe or pipeline, storage container, or any site or area where a hazardous substance has been deposited, stored, placed, or otherwise come to be located.
16. Respondent’s facility is a “facility” as that term is defined under Section 101(9) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(9).
17. Ferrous chloride (CAS #7758-94-3) is a “hazardous substance” as that term is defined under Section 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14).
18. Ferrous chloride (CAS #7758-94-3) has a reportable quantity of 100 pounds, as indicated at 40 C.F.R. Part 302, Table 302.4.
19. On or about November 18, 2021, a release occurred from Respondent’s facility of approximately 317 pounds of ferrous chloride (the release).
20. In a 24-hour time period, the release of ferrous chloride exceeded 100 pounds.

21. During the release, approximately 317 pounds of ferrous chloride spilled, leaked, pumped, discharged, injected, or escaped into the ground.

22. The release is a “release” as that term is defined under Section 101(22) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(22).

23. Respondent had knowledge of the release on November 18, 2021, at approximately 4:30 p.m.

24. The release was one for which notice was required under Section 103(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9603(a).

25. Respondent notified the NRC of the release on November 19, 2021, at 3:30 p.m.

26. Respondent did not immediately notify the NRC as soon as Respondent had knowledge of the release.

27. Respondent’s failure to immediately notify the NRC of the release is a violation of Section 103(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9603(a).

#### **Civil Penalty**

28. Complainant has determined that an appropriate civil penalty to settle this action is \$7,349 for the CERCLA violation. In determining the penalty amount, Complainant considered the nature, circumstances, extent, and gravity of the violation, and with respect to Respondent, its ability to pay, prior history of violations, economic benefit or savings resulting from the violation, and any other matters as justice may require. Complainant also considered U.S. EPA’s Enforcement Response Policy for Sections 304, 311 and 312 of the Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act and Section 103 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response Compensation and Liability Act, dated September 30, 1999 (EPCRA/CERCLA Enforcement Response Policy).

29. Within 30 days after the effective date of this CAFO, Respondent must pay a \$7,349 civil penalty for the CERCLA violation. Respondent must pay the penalty by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund," to:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Superfund Payments  
Cincinnati Finance Center  
P.O. Box 979076  
St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

For checks sent by express mail, by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund," to:

U.S. Bank  
Government Lockbox 979076  
U.S. EPA Superfund Payments  
1005 Convention Plaza  
Mail Station SL-MO-C2-GL  
St. Louis, MO 63101

The check must note the following: City of Cincinnati, the docket number of this CAFO - CERCLA-05-2023-0002, and the billing document number 2752330B002.

30. A transmittal letter, stating Respondent's name, the case name, Respondent's complete address, the case docket number, and the billing document number, must accompany the payment. Respondent must send a copy of the check and transmittal letter to:

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-19J)  
U.S. EPA, Region 5  
77 West Jackson Blvd.  
Chicago, IL 60604  
[r5hearingclerk@epa.gov](mailto:r5hearingclerk@epa.gov)

James Entzminger (SE-5J)  
Chemical Emergency Preparedness  
and Prevention Section  
U.S. EPA, Region 5  
77 West Jackson Blvd.  
Chicago, IL 60604  
[entzminger.james@epa.gov](mailto:entzminger.james@epa.gov)

Lisa Frasco (C-14J)  
Office of Regional Counsel  
U.S. EPA, Region 5  
77 West Jackson Blvd.  
Chicago, IL 60604  
[frasco.lisa@epa.gov](mailto:frasco.lisa@epa.gov)

31. This civil penalty is not deductible for federal tax purposes.

32. If Respondent does not timely pay the civil penalty, U.S. EPA may bring an action to collect any unpaid portion of the penalty with interest, handling charges, nonpayment penalties and the United States enforcement expenses for the collection action. The validity, amount, and appropriateness of the civil penalty are not reviewable in a collection action.

33. Pursuant to 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, Respondent must pay the following on any amount overdue under this CAFO. Interest will accrue on any amount overdue from the date the payment was due at a rate established pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717. Respondent must pay a \$15 handling charge each month that any portion of the penalty is more than 30 days past due. In addition, U.S. EPA will assess a 6 percent per year penalty on any principal amount 90 days past due.

#### **General Provisions**

34. The parties consent to service of this CAFO by email at the following valid email addresses: [frasco.lisa@epa.gov](mailto:frasco.lisa@epa.gov) (for Complainant) and [neal.frink@cincinnati-oh.gov](mailto:neal.frink@cincinnati-oh.gov) (for Respondent).

35. Full payment of the penalty and compliance with this CAFO resolves only Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violation alleged in the CAFO.

36. This CAFO does not affect the rights of U.S. EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law.

37. Respondent certifies that it is complying with Section 103(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9603(a).

38. This CAFO does not affect Respondent's responsibility to comply with CERCLA, and other applicable federal, state, and local laws and regulations.

39. This CAFO is a "final order" for purposes of U.S. EPA's EPCRA/CERCLA Enforcement Response Policy.

40. The terms of this CAFO bind Respondent and its successors and assigns.

41. Each person signing this consent agreement certifies that he or she has the authority to sign for the party whom he or she represents and to bind that party to its terms.

42. Each party agrees to bear its own costs and attorney's fees in this action.

43. This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement between the parties.

In the Matter of: City of Cincinnati, Loveland, Ohio  
Docket No. CERCLA-05-2023-0002

---

**City of Cincinnati, Ohio, Respondent**

10/31/2022  
Date

Sheryl M.M. Long  
Sheryl M.M. Long  
City Manager  
City of Cincinnati, Ohio

Recommended By:

Diana Christy  
Diana Christy, Director  
Metropolitan Sewer District of Greater Cincinnati

Approved as to Form:

FLIRK  
Assistant City Solicitor

In the Matter of: City of Cincinnati, Ohio  
Docket No. CERCLA-05-2023-0002

---

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Complainant

Jason El-  
Zein

Digitally signed by  
Jason El-Zein  
Date: 2022.11.08  
17:50:45 -05'00'

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jason El-Zein  
Manager, Emergency Response Branch 1  
Superfund & Emergency Management Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Region 5

DOUGLAS  
BALLOTTI

Digitally signed by  
DOUGLAS BALLOTTI  
Date: 2022.11.09  
07:52:05 -06'00'

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Douglas Ballotti  
Director  
Superfund & Emergency Management Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Region 5

**In the Matter of: City of Cincinnati, Ohio**  
**Docket No. CERCLA-05-2023-0002**

---

**Final Order**

This Consent Agreement and Final Order, as agreed to by the parties, shall become effective immediately upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31. IT IS SO ORDERED.

---

Date

---

Ann L. Coyle  
Regional Judicial Officer  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Region 5